



## Can the DSM-5 differentiate between nonpathological possession and dissociative identity disorder? A case study from an Afro-Brazilian religion

Romara Delmonte BSc, Giancarlo Lucchetti MD, PhD, Alexander Moreira-Almeida MD, PhD & Miguel Farias BSc, MA, DPhil

**To cite this article:** Romara Delmonte BSc, Giancarlo Lucchetti MD, PhD, Alexander Moreira-Almeida MD, PhD & Miguel Farias BSc, MA, DPhil (2016) Can the DSM-5 differentiate between nonpathological possession and dissociative identity disorder? A case study from an Afro-Brazilian religion, *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 17:3, 322-337, DOI: [10.1080/15299732.2015.1103351](https://doi.org/10.1080/15299732.2015.1103351)

**To link to this article:** <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/15299732.2015.1103351>



Accepted author version posted online: 13 Oct 2015.  
Published online: 13 Oct 2015.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 90



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)

ARTICLE

## Can the *DSM-5* differentiate between nonpathological possession and dissociative identity disorder? A case study from an Afro-Brazilian religion

Romara Delmonte BSc<sup>a,b</sup>, Giancarlo Lucchetti, MD, PhD<sup>b</sup>,  
Alexander Moreira-Almeida, MD, PhD<sup>b</sup>, and Miguel Farias, BSc, MA, DPhil<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Centre for Research in Psychology, Behaviour & Achievement, Coventry University, Coventry, England;

<sup>b</sup>NUPEs—Research Center in Spirituality and Health, School of Medicine, Federal University of Juiz de Fora, Minas Gerais, Brazil

### ABSTRACT

The aim of this article is to examine whether the diagnostic criteria of the *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition (DSM-5)*, are able to differentiate between nonpathological religious possession and dissociative identity disorder (DID). We use the case study of an individual who leads an Afro-Brazilian religious group (Umbanda), focusing on her personal development and possession experiences from early childhood to the present, spanning a period of more than 40 years, and examine these data following *DSM-5* criteria for DID (300.14). Her experiences of possession can be broken into 2 distinct stages. In the 1st stage (childhood and early adulthood), she displayed intrusive thoughts and a lack of control over possession states, which were associated with a heightened state of anxiety, loneliness, amnesia, and family conflict (meeting all 5 criteria for DID). In the 2nd stage (late 20s up to the present), she regularly experienced possession states but felt in control of their onset and found them religiously meaningful. In this 2nd stage, she only fulfilled 3 criteria for DID. We question the accuracy of diagnosing this individual with DID in her earlier life and suggest that the *DSM-5* criteria fail to address the ambiguity of affect surrounding possession experiences (positive at the individual level, negative at the interpersonal level) and lack a clearer acknowledgment of the prevalence of possession and other unusual experiences in general populations.

### ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 20 February 2015

Accepted 12 September 2015

### KEYWORDS

Dissociative identity disorder; *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition*; possession; spiritual experiences

Despite the breadth of epidemiological studies associating spirituality with health (Koenig, King, & Carson, 2012; Lucchetti & Lucchetti, 2014), research on the mental health of individuals who regularly experience possession states within a spiritual context is scarce (Moreira-Almeida & Cardeña, 2011). This gap in the literature increases the risk of taking nonpathological spiritual

**CONTACT** Miguel Farias, BSc, MA, DPhil  [miguel.farias@coventry.ac.uk](mailto:miguel.farias@coventry.ac.uk)  Centre for Research in Psychology, Behaviour & Achievement, Coventry University, Priory Street, Coventry, CV1 5FB, England.

© 2016 Taylor & Francis

experiences as mental disorders (especially dissociative or psychotic ones) or vice versa (Moreira-Almeida, Almeida, & Lotufo Neto, 2005; Moreira-Almeida & Koss-Chioino, 2009; Ross, 2011).

Possession states are widely reported across cultures. Bourguignon (1973) reported that the ritual elicitation of altered states of consciousness, particularly those associated with possession, was present in more than 450 societies. In the West, possession experiences are common in Evangelical Pentecostal and Charismatic Catholic churches, Afro-American religions, Spiritism, and Spiritualism (Harding, 2005).

Within European countries, like the United Kingdom, there is a growing societal awareness of possession experiences, particularly within Asian communities, and a call for health providers to address these experiences within a culturally sensitive framework (Nye, 2012). This awareness has stimulated the organization of regular interdisciplinary conferences on spirit possession and mental health, at which clinicians and religious and ethnic community leaders discuss how to differentiate between healthy and pathological possession (Ethnic Health Initiative, 2015).

In non-European countries like Brazil, possession experiences are a crucial element of religions-like Spiritism, Candomblé, and Umbanda (Harding, 2005). This last one is a religion developed in the early 20th century in Brazil that mixes elements related to native, African, and Roman Catholic religions as well as to Spiritism (a spiritualist philosophy based on the 19th-century writings of Allan Kardec). The latest Brazilian census (Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics, 2010) reports that more than 4 million people are affiliated with one of these religions, which means that they either experience possession states or interact with people experiencing possession on a regular basis. In addition, many Brazilians who report an affiliation with other religions (e.g., Roman Catholics) often attend Spiritist and African Brazilian ceremonies (Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics, 2010; Prandi, 2004; Schmidt, 2011).

The modern history of the clinical evaluation of possession experiences taking place within religious contexts is underpinned by ambiguity. During the first part of the 20th century, religious possession was either classified as pathological or treated as a phenomenon of the lower classes (Almeida, Oda, & Dalgarrondo, 2007; Moreira-Almeida et al., 2005).

More recent epidemiological studies of possession with Spiritist individuals showed a high prevalence of dissociative and psychotic-like experiences, though these were not associated with mental disorders. However, they also found that a lower controllability of the possession states was correlated with poorer mental health (Moreira-Almeida, Lotufo Neto, & Greyson, 2007; Negro, Palladino-Negro, & Louzã, 2002). Another study, which compared Brazilian Spiritist mediums with Canadian and U.S. dissociative identity disorder (DID) patients,

found that the mediums had better social adjustment and a lower prevalence of mental disorders and of childhood abuse (Moreira-Almeida, Neto, & Cardeña, 2008).

Clearly, the connection between religious possession and mental health or illness is ambiguous, calling for further work in this area. This need is particularly salient today in the context of criticisms of the new *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition* (DSM-5; e.g., British Psychological Society, 2011) and a growing interest in spiritual ideas, which sometimes envisage mental health problems as only part of the spiritual process (Farias, Underwood, & Claridge, 2012).

The DSM-5 includes possession experiences under the label of DID. In this article, we are interested in exploring whether the diagnosis criteria of DID are able to differentiate between nonpathological possession and mental disorder. We address this question through the case study of a religious leader of Umbanda, one of the main possession religions in Brazil.

Case studies are an integral part of the mental diagnosis tradition (Martínez-Taboas, 1999; Rabelo, 2008). In an editorial in the *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, Somer (2008) argued for the need for in-depth case studies to further understanding of dissociative states and disorders. Therefore, our aim in this article is to contribute to this body of work by examining the diagnostic accuracy of DID in the DSM-5 through an account of an individual displaying possession experiences since childhood.

### **Differentiating DID from healthy possession**

The DSM-5 describes DID as a disruption in identity characterized by a discontinuity in one's sense of self accompanied by alterations in affect, behavior, consciousness, memory, perception, cognition, and/or sensorimotor functioning (see Table 1, left-hand column). Criterion D further explains that the "disturbance is not a normal part of a broadly accepted cultural or religious practice" (American Psychiatric Association, 2013, p. 292), which introduces a particular problem to the diagnostic criteria: How can a clinician living in a culture where possession is partly accepted differentiate pathological from religious possession? The DSM-5 attempts to provide further insights into this differentiation process by considering that pathological possession would be differentiated by virtue of the fact that it is

involuntary, distressing, uncontrollable, and often recurrent or persistent; involves conflict between the individual and his or her surrounding family, social or work milieu; and is manifested at times and in places that violate the norms of the culture or religion. (p. 295)

**Table 1.** Two-stage diagnosis of the case study following *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition*, criteria for dissociative identity disorder (300.14; F44.81).

Diagnostic criterion	Before 27 years	After 27 years	Case study
A. Disruption of identity characterized by two or more distinct personality states or an experience of possession. This involves marked discontinuity in sense of self and sense of agency, accompanied by related alterations in affect, behavior, consciousness, memory, perception, cognition, and/or sensorimotor functioning.	Yes	Yes	Dona Sara reports, both during childhood and as an adult, episodes of identity disruption characterized by a loss of senses and awareness of time as well as behavioral symptoms (like shaking and heart palpitations).
B. Recurrent gaps in the recall of everyday events, important personal information, and/or traumatic events that are inconsistent with ordinary forgetting.	Yes	Yes	Dona Sara reports partial to full amnesia during periods of possession. Although she recalls having been vaguely conscious during the first possession experience, she was unconscious during the second one. In the second part of her life she compares her possession to a state of deep sleep.
C. The symptoms cause clinically significant distress or impairment in social, occupational, or other important areas of functioning.	Yes	No	She reports severe social and psychological distress in dealing with her unusual experiences and possession states in childhood. This distress ceases to exist after Dona Sara joins an Umbanda group.
D. The disturbance is not a normal part of a broadly accepted cultural or religious practice. (Note: In children, the symptoms are not attributable to imaginary playmates or other fantasy play.)	Yes	No	Presently, Dona Sara's regular possession states take place and are framed within a religious context. But before she was 27, her symptoms caused severe interpersonal distress within her family and community. What she experienced was not part of her Roman Catholic culture and upbringing.
E. The symptoms are not attributable to the direct physiological effects of a substance (e.g., blackouts or chaotic behavior during alcohol intoxication) or another medical condition (e.g., complex partial seizures).	No	No	Dona Sara's possession during both childhood and her adult life is not linked to the ingestion of any substances or a medical condition.

Source: American Psychiatric Association, 2015, p.292.

However, the *DSM-5* does not acknowledge the interaction between the individual experience, which can be positive, and the stress caused by social stigma or nonacceptance of possession states; it does not address the often ambiguous sociocultural dynamics of the acceptance or rejection of possession states; neither does it consider how possession experience can develop when framed within a belief system (Martins, 2011; Rabelo, 2008). In relation to this third point of controlling possession states, there is growing evidence that religious training on how to manage possession states is associated with better control and integration of these experiences in one's life (Almeida, 2004; Negro et al., 2002). It has also been found that people experiencing possession and other unusual perceptions may be drawn to a religion like

Spiritism as a way of coping with and cognitively framing these life experiences (Alminhana, 2013; Menezes, 2012; Menezes, Alminhana, & Moreira-Almeida, 2012; Moreira-Almeida et al., 2007).

These clinical studies are complemented by the vast anthropological literature on Afro-Brazilian religions that suggests that the quality of the possession experience develops in time, often moving from an involuntary and uncontrollable state to a voluntary one in which the possessed individual completely loses self-awareness (Mota & Trad, 2011; Zangari, 2005). The emic explanation (from religious groups) that the individual gift of being possessed by spirits or gods requires training, and that there is a development of this capacity, has not received enough attention in modern research and diagnostic guidelines.

Thus, in addition to exploring whether the *DSM-5* can differentiate between nonpathological possession and DID, we also wanted to examine the development of the possession experience over time, which makes the use of a case study particularly relevant. Here we apply *DSM-5* criteria to the possession experiences of an individual since her childhood.

## Method

The research subject of this study, Dona Sara Jeronimo, 55 years old, was selected because of her leading role in a religious community in the state of Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. (The subject's name has been disguised, and other noncrucial information has been altered to preserve anonymity. The subject gave written consent for the publication of her case.) Dona Sara is highly regarded for her human qualities but also because of the quality of her trance; in the words of her followers, she is a "very good medium" with a "great talent for being possessed." The first author collected data for this article over the course of five semistructured and clinical (Structural Clinical Interview for *DSM-5*) interviews (2 hr each), focusing on life development, possession, and other unusual/spiritual experiences from childhood to the present. Our aim was to gather a comprehensive account of Dona Sara's experience of possession, including associated sensations, emotions, and social/family connections, so as to examine them in relation to *DSM-5* criteria for DID.

## Case description

Dona Sara is a 55-year-old woman who leads Umbanda groups, providing regular counselling and healing to more than 150 people. She reported sleeping on average 5 hr per night, and less on the days when she works in a possession state. At the time she was interviewed, she had never been to a psychiatrist or clinical psychologist. She also reported not taking drugs or alcohol, though when in a possessed state she often drinks wine or *cachaça* (a distilled alcoholic Brazilian drink).

She has been a member of the Umbanda religion, taking part in regular rituals, for the past 28 years. Umbanda's leaders are highly esteemed and treated as wise figures who are chosen by the gods or spirits for this role (Cohen, 2007; Landes, 2002; Prandi, 1991). As well as performing healing and divination, they also offer spiritual advice to individuals reporting unusual or anomalous experiences.

Umbanda is characterized as a trance religion (Sousa, 2004) in which possession is understood as a means of communicating with the spirit world. Heavily influenced in its rituals involving music and dance by the African religion of Candomblé (Bastide, 1995), Umbanda includes a wide range of spiritual entities (both nature spirits and supposedly deceased humans) that provide practical moral advice and healing.

Since joining Umbanda in her late 20s, Dona Sara's life has been characterized by weekly religious possession, which she claimed gives her a sense of "peace and tranquility." However, when at the age of 7 she started having unusual experiences, which she called "intuitions, premonitions, and trance states . . . like someone else being in my body," she had no guidance, and her family and religious community did not support these experiences. As a teenager, she felt anguished, lonely, and afraid to be looked at as "mad." Only later, through the Umbanda religion, was she able to have a meaningful framework and supportive community that helped her learn how to deal with and control her possession states.

Next we describe how her unusual and possession experiences evolved over the course of time.

## **First stage**

### ***Early experiences (7–13 Years Old)***

Her first unusual experiences, at the age of 7, were characterized by intrusive thoughts:

I started having these experiences very young, odd experiences like something came into my mind, an idea about something happening to someone. I'd tell this to my family, and 3 or 4 days later the event happened. This usually concerned a health problem or even the death of people who were close to my family, friends and neighbors.

Dona Sara's family members were practicing Roman Catholics and were not supportive of these intrusive thoughts; they forbade her to talk about them. She then went through a period in which she prayed regularly, asking God to make the thoughts go away. She felt guilty about these coming to life, as if she herself were the agent of the unfortunate events. However, despite her prayers and family's admonitions, the thoughts kept entering her mind involuntarily, and they were so powerful that she felt the need to talk about them.

At the age of 9, she went to a religious boarding school. She and her family hoped that when she was surrounded by Catholic nuns the intrusive thoughts would stop. But despite her good academic achievement, the thoughts continued, and Dona Sara felt compelled to share them with colleagues and teachers. Before long, her parents were told that she had to leave the school, and it was recommended to her family that she be exorcised of the bad “spirits” that were causing her intrusive thoughts.

When she returned home, two key events took place. The first was a premonition that concerned a next-door neighbor and close family friend. An intrusive thought, “like a clear voice speaking,” told Dona Sara that he would die soon, which eventually happened 3 days later; he was previously healthy and died of an unexpected heart attack. A number of people outside of the close family heard about this, which led to a gathering of the extended family to discuss how to deal with her unusual thoughts in order to avoid gossip and stigmatization. Dona Sara, distressed about the family reunion, went into her room to be away from everyone. She put on a white dress and went to bed, staying there for hours in an unusual state of mind, feeling neither thirst nor hunger, within an atmosphere of peace and tranquility as if she were not in this world. “It was so pleasant and peaceful,” Dona Sara declared, “that I didn’t want to come out of it.” According to her, this was her first possession experience. She could hear people around her but felt “far away, absent in mind and spirit” and sensing a presence within that partially took over her body. She felt that this presence meant no harm but just wanted to “be in me.” After a number of failed attempts to bring Dona Sara out of her “sleep,” her mother called a local healer who “knew how to deal with spirits” and, through prayers, managed to “bring me back.”

Dona Sara recalled another possession episode that happened when she was 13 and visited an Afro-Brazilian religious community of Candomblé. She was taken there by a family member with the purpose of healing her of the premonitions and possession states. The ritual had already started when they arrived; there were many people singing and dancing. The moment Dona Sara entered the religious space (*terreiro*), she immediately lost control and went into a possession state. When she returned to her everyday self, she felt scared and angry because of “having no control over what was happening to me.” However, she also described that while possessed she felt “something good, warm; it didn’t feel bad at all; at the same time that I feared what was happening to me, I was fascinated by it.”

### ***Adolescence to early adulthood (13–26 years old)***

From the age of 13 to 25, Dona Sara gradually developed a way of dealing with the premonitions and possession. She would keep to herself, not disclosing what she experienced to her family, and kept praying for the experiences to stop. She felt lonely and distressed. The intrusive thoughts, or

“messages,” started being preceded by marked physical symptoms, including body tremors and heart palpitations. When her body started “acting” like this, she knew a message was coming.

When Dona Sara turned 26, her unusual experiences intensified and she decided to seek help from the leader of an Umbanda group. She was then told that she had a spiritual gift and ought to develop it. “Meeting this Umbanda leader,” Dona Sara said, “was like being in the presence of a medical doctor who knows exactly what you’re going through.”

After this meeting, she started attending Umbanda rituals. On her first visit, as soon as she was taken into the center of the ritual space, she “felt a very strong tinnitus, a kind of bell, only solid, really strong” and then lost consciousness. When she came to, she knew that a spirit had taken over her body; she felt “very numb and distant.” When we further inquired about this episode, she reported that, though not properly awake and unable to act, she had an awareness of being possessed.

## **Second stage**

### ***Development of religious possession***

***The first 3 years (27–30 years old).*** Dona Sara reported that during the first 3 years of regular Umbanda attendance, her possession trance was “gradual, like a smokescreen”; she could see people around her and listen to them, though it all felt distant. Although she had no control over some parts of her body, usually the legs, she did not lose her sense of self involuntarily anymore. She was still afraid of the spirits that possessed her and of having her body “taken over,” but generally after the ritual she felt relaxed and at peace, “like coming back from a deep sleep.” She was also pleasantly surprised by the positive comments of the people who had been healed by her.

***The present (30–55 years old).*** Dona Sara reported that since turning 30, when possessed she loses consciousness, stops “seeing, hearing or feeling anything; like being under general anesthesia.” On various occasions, the first author witnessed Dona Sara leading Umbanda rituals, where she was in a possessed state for up to 4 hr. After a short lecture, usually on a moral topic (e.g., happiness, faith, love), she leads the group in prayers and directs the music and dance to start. As soon as the dance begins, some individuals show physical tremors or laugh loudly and then turn to the whole group to greet them: “I’m here!” “Good evening!” or “I’ve come to heal and work with you.” Dona Sara, after overseeing the possession of these individuals, goes into a trance: Her breathing gets heavy, her body shakes and swings back and forth, all this with eyes closed; she then opens her eyes and remains very still. While this happens, people gather around her, some kneeling, others clapping.

When we asked about her mental state immediately before going into a trance, she said that she prays and focuses on “God and the spirits.” She added that one instant “I am with the group and then it all disappears and I come back hours later.” Dona Sara acts differently, depending on the type of spirit that possesses her. When it is a child, she sucks her thumb, lies on the floor in a playful way, and giggles recurrently; when it is a cow-herding man (*boiadeiro*), she scratches her chin as if she has a beard; if she is possessed by an old woman, Dona Sara contracts her facial muscles, bends forward, and asks for a walking stick. During the possession, she speaks individually to members of the group, giving moral advice on how to conduct their lives or deal with particular problems. The possession state ends with another tremor of the body. Dona Sara then greets everyone and asks the group to tell her what the spirits said. When asked about how she feels at the end of the possession state, she said,

I feel like coming back from a long sleep, but with the difference that I am fully rested and extremely light, not hungry or thirsty. There’s also an indescribable sense of peace and wholeness, and I want to hold on to this feeling and keep to myself.

How does Dona Sara differentiate between herself and the spirits that possess her? She said that

I am not the spirits; I couldn’t bear to be so many selves. They are in a different space, they respect me, they’re sacred. I like myself for what I am: a mother, a good cook, a spiritual adviser; but I am not a spirit, I’m human.

### **Analysis based on *DSM-5* criteria for DID**

Dona Sara’s experiences of possession fall into two distinct stages. The first one, covering her childhood and early adulthood, is characterized by intrusive thoughts and possession states that were associated with a heightened state of anxiety, loneliness, family conflict, social stigma, and lack of control over the possession experiences. However, at the same time, Dona Sara often described the experience of possession as “pleasant,” “good,” or “peaceful.” Although this sense of subjective well-being is somewhat atypical of DID possession cases, in Dona Sara it co-occurs with intense distress (as described in Criterion C), such as her lack of personal control over thought intrusions and alterations of sense of self, aggravated by the social disapproval from family, community, and peers.

In the second period, which begins at the age of 27 and coincides with Dona Sara taking part in regular Umbanda rituals, she is in control of the onset of the possession experiences; she has a functional socioreligious network; and there is a sense of fulfilment, even enjoyment, about her possession experiences. Furthermore, she eventually emerges as a religious leader whose moral and spiritual advice is sought out.

In the right-hand column of [Table 1](#), we show how much the two distinct stages of Dona Sara's possession experiences fulfill *DSM-5* criteria for DID. In the first stage, Dona Sara meets all five criteria. Regarding Criterion A, Dona Sara regularly experiences a range of intrusive thoughts and affective states different from her everyday self that culminate in possession by an unknown source (she describes a loss of consciousness and memory but does not attribute it to a particular "entity"). In relation to Criterion C, as well as social intolerance and prejudice, her distress is caused by recurrent, inexplicable intrusions into conscious functioning (e.g., intrusive thoughts and emotions); alterations of sense of self (e.g., feeling like one's body or actions are not one's own), odd changes of perception (e.g., feeling detached from one's body), and the uncontrollability of these unusual experiences.

In the second stage of her life, though, she only meets Criteria A, C, and E: She regularly experiences possession within an Umbanda religious community but can control the emergence of this phenomenon and looks forward to it, although she is not conscious of what happens; furthermore, she has found within this religion a supportive community and an existential framework for her unusual experiences.

If she had been seen by a clinician during the first stage of her experiences, it is very likely she would have been diagnosed with DID. But would this be an accurate diagnosis? There are two ways in which we can interpret the evolution of Dona Sara's possession experiences. We may argue that for the first part of her life she suffered from DID, but this disorder eventually subsided when she entered a religious group, which provided her with social support, a spiritual framework to interpret her experiences, and the necessary training to control and develop them. If we consider the positive attachment to the group as mirroring that of an individual therapist, this would help explain the remission of her DID symptoms (Baars et al., 2011). However, Dona Sara's consistent characterization of possession states as positive—pleasant, good, peaceful—despite the suffering derived from their social unacceptability and the ensuing loneliness, as well as her later development as a leader in a possession-based religion, all suggest that a diagnosis of DID in her earlier life would be clinically inappropriate.

The latter argument seems more robust for various reasons. It fits in better with our growing understanding of dispositions toward unusual experiences and how these can be understood as the expression of personality traits, such as schizotypy, which only in their extreme are associated with mental illness (Claridge, 1997). From an early age, Dona Sara showed a disposition toward unusual experiences; if, during her childhood and adolescence, she had found a supportive community and the cognitive framework to make sense of these experiences, it is quite likely that she would not have felt threatened or distressed. This is what eventually happened when she entered the Umbanda group, where she flourished not in spite of but *because of* her

natural susceptibility toward experiencing possession states. A diagnosis of DID in her early life would thus reflect a neglect of the social roots of Dona Sara's suffering and would only add to her social stigmatization.

## Discussion

Although we appreciate that there has been an attempt with the *DSM-5* to establish a more sophisticated and culturally sensitive diagnosis of DID, we propose that it is in need of further refinement as a tool to help clinicians differentiate nonpathological possession from clinical disorder. One could argue that Dona Sara did actually have a mental disorder that had a good prognosis and was eventually healed when she came in contact with a supportive group. Contrary to this perspective, we suggest that Dona Sara never had DID but displayed dissociative and spiritual experiences that were not well integrated in the first part of her life because she lacked social acceptance and a cultural framework to make these experiences meaningful and controllable. This case study suggests that if there had been a diagnosis of DID in the first part of her life, this diagnosis would have relied *too* heavily on the social conflict and cultural unacceptability of her experiences.

Based on our analysis of this case, we suggest that future revisions of the *DSM* include two considerations. First, the *DSM* needs to address the ambiguity of feelings (co-occurrence of positive and negative affect) surrounding possession experiences; second, it should acknowledge the widespread report of unusual or anomalous experiences in general populations where they may not be part of accepted cultural practices and move beyond a dualistic account of possession experiences as either religious or pathological.

Let's consider first the ambiguity of affect toward the experience of possession. Negative affect is a key characteristic of most clinical disorders. However, with possession, and unusual experiences more generally, there often is an ambiguity of feelings about what one is experiencing (Martins, 2011; Rabelo, 2008). In our case study, although there was distress surrounding the social acceptance of and her own lack of understanding and control over of these unusual experiences, the experiences were also characterized as "pleasant and peaceful" and made her feel "good and warm." We should note that, in relation to this ambiguity of affect, Dona Sara's case is far from unique. Many religious leaders describe intensely stressful experiences, sometimes associated with social disapproval or even persecution, leading to their conversion experiences, that fill them with a heightened sense of meaning and purpose in life (James, 1902/1929). It is also not uncommon for individuals affected by possession experiences to report psychosocial stress (Alminhana, Menezes, & Moreira-Almeida, 2013; Bayer & Shunaigat, 2002; Menezes et al., 2012) and to seek assistance from religious groups or healers (Roder & Opalic, 1987). Further research is needed to understand the extent

to which the development of healthy religious possession, and of religious leadership in particular, may be associated with previous social disapproval and distress.

By failing to mention the possibility of negative and positive affect co-occurring in healthy possession experiences, we are giving more weight to their negative, social symptoms, while neglecting their positive individual aspects. This not only may lead to a Type 1 error of DID (a false positive) but also is preventing a more sophisticated understanding of possession experiences. The *DSM-5* does not differentiate between internal and external sources of distress/dysfunction for DID; future revisions could specify that clinicians should be aware of this disparity or ambiguity.

Toward the end of our set of interviews with Dona Sara, she told us that one of her greatest fears, as a teenager, was the idea of being taken to a doctor and diagnosed with a mental disorder. If that had happened, she said, “I would never have found my spiritual home or become who I am.” She is possibly right. If, however, the *DSM-5* were to include in its descriptive notes on possession experience the possibility of ambiguous affect—a sense of well-being co-occurring with social distress and fear of lacking control and understanding—clinicians would be less likely to fall for a Type 1 error of diagnosis.

It is also sensible to acknowledge that some religious communities may have the cognitive and behavioral resources to make possession-prone individuals feel balanced and thrive. It is not our role as clinicians and researchers to agree or disagree with particular belief systems, but there is wide evidence that religious practice is associated with better mental health outcomes (Bonelli & Koenig, 2013; Moreira-Almeida, Koenig, & Lucchetti, 2014), and possession-based religions, though seldom studied in this clinical context, may have a similar positive effect on their members (Moreira-Almeida et al., 2007). There clearly is a need for further research in this area. One interesting hypothesis to test is that dissociative experiences will not be detrimental for an individual who is embedded within a cognitive framework or belief system and/or a social network that accepts these experiences as positive and meaningful; however, these experiences will cause distress and impairment if the individual does not have a supportive social network or cognitive framework.

We now turn to the second point about culture and possession. Implicit in the *DSM-5* criteria (particularly Criterion D) is a dualistic account of possession experiences as either supported by one’s culture/religion or not. If the surrounding culture supports them, they are a healthy experience; if it does not, however, they are more likely to be pathological. As our case study reveals, there is no such black-and-white distinction. Although possession is part of the repertoire of Brazilian religious practices, it is not approved by the dominant Roman Catholic culture. But this is not an idiosyncratic case:

Anomalous experiences, including possession, are pan-cultural phenomena reported in general populations. In Canada, for example, where possession and trance experiences are not broadly accepted cultural or religious practices, 32% of individuals from a large sample reported having experienced them at least once, and 19% reported having experienced them between 10 and 50 times in their lives (Ross, 2011). Other research from general and clinical (DID) populations, conducted in the United States and Turkey suggests that possession is not a culture-bound phenomenon (Ross & Ness, 2010; Ross, Schroeder, & Ness, 2013; Sar, Alioğlu, & Akyüz, 2014). Thus, cases such as Dona Sara's are likely to occur elsewhere. Future revisions of the *DSM-5* need to include a more sophisticated framework that portrays these experiences as universal rather than culture or religious bound. This would be substantiated by what is known about variations of these experiences at not only the cultural level but the level of individual differences, including gender and personality traits.

In sum, with each successive edition, the *DSM* has refined its criteria for diagnosing pathological possession. It has, for example, paid greater attention to cultural variations in possession and to its common occurrence in religious contexts; it also has a broad understanding of the agent of possession (e.g., as a ghost, deity, or demon). However, we suggest that it still needs to go further—by acknowledging the ambiguity of affect in possession cases (including the potential social stigma driving the suffering) and by providing a more sophisticated account of how culture and other variables shape possession experiences.

## References

- Almeida, A.M. (2004). *Fenomenologia das experiências mediúnicas, perfil e psicopatologia dos médiuns espíritas [Phenomenology of mediumistic experiences, profile, and psychopathology of Spiritist mediums]* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Faculdade de Medicina da Universidade de São Paulo, São Paulo, Brazil.
- Almeida, A., Oda, A., & Dalgarrondo, P. (2007). Brazilian psychiatrists' approaches on trance and possession phenomena. *Revista De Psiquiatria Clinica*, 34, 34–41.
- Alminhana, L. (2013). *A Personalidade como critério para o diagnóstico diferencial entre experiências anômalas e transtornos mentais. [Personality as a criterion for the differential diagnosis of anomalous experiences and mental disorders.]* (Unpublished PhD dissertation). Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora, Minas Gerais, Brazil.
- Alminhana, L. O., Menezes, A., Jr., & Moreira-Almeida, A. (2013). Personalidade, religiosidade e qualidade de vida em indivíduos que apresentam experiências anômalas em grupos religiosos [Personality, religiosity and quality of life in people presenting anomalous experiences within religious groups]. *Jornal Brasileiro De Psiquiatria*, 62(4), 268–274. doi:10.1590/S0047-20852013000400004
- American Psychiatric Association. (2013). *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders* (5th ed.). Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Association.

- Baars, E. W., van der Hart, O., Nijenhuis, E. R., Chu, J. A., Glas, G., & Draijer, N. (2011). Predicting stabilizing treatment outcomes for complex post-traumatic stress disorder and dissociative identity disorder: An expertise-based prognostic model. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 12(1), 67–87. doi:10.1080/15299732.2010.514846
- Bastide, R. (1995/2007). *The African religions of Brazil: Toward a sociology of the interpenetration of civilizations*. Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Bayer, R. S., & Shunaigat, W. M. (2002). Sociodemographic and clinical characteristics of possessive disorder in Jordan. *Neurosciences*, 7(1), 46–49.
- Bonelli, R. M., & Koenig, H. G. (2013). Mental disorders, religion and spirituality 1990 to 2010: A systematic evidence-based review. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 52(2), 657–673. doi:10.1007/s10943-013-9691-4
- Bourguignon, E. (1973). *Religion, altered states of consciousness and social change*. Columbus: The Ohio State University Press.
- Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics. (2010). *Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística*. Retrieved from <http://www.ibge.gov.br/home/presidencia/noticias/imprensa/pppts/00000009352506122012255229285110.pdf>
- British Psychological Society. (2011). *The BPS response to the American Psychiatric Association: DSM–5 development*. Retrieved from <http://apps.bps.org.uk/publicationfiles/consultation-responses/DSM-5%202011%20-%20BPS%20response.pdf>
- Claridge, G. (Ed.). (1997). *Schizotypy: Implications for illness and health*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Cohen, E. (2007). *The mind possessed: The cognition of spirit possession in an Afro-Brazilian religious tradition*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Ethnic Health Initiative. (2015). Spirit possession and mental health conference, London, 9th March.
- Farias, M., Underwood, R., & Claridge, G. (2012). Unusual but sound minds: Mental health indicators in spiritual individual. *British Journal of Psychology*, 104(3), 364–381. doi:10.1111/j.2044-8295.2012.02128.x
- Harding, R. E. (2005). Afro-Brazilian religions. In L. Jones (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of religion* (Vol. 1, 2nd ed., pp. 119–125). Farmington Hills, MI: Thomson Gale.
- James, W. (1929). *The varieties of religious experience: A study in human nature*. New York, NY: The Modern Library. (Original work published 1902)
- Koenig, H., King, D., & Carson, B. (2012). *Handbook of religion and health*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Landes, R. (2002). *A Cidade das Mulheres [The City of Women]*. Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro.
- Lucchetti, G., & Lucchetti, A. (2014). Spirituality, religion, and health: Over the last 15 years of field research (1999–2013). *International Journal of Psychiatry in Medicine*, 48(3), 199–215. doi:10.2190/PM.48.3.e
- Martínez-Taboas, A. (1999). A clinical case study: A case of spirit possession and glossolalia. *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry*, 23, 333–348. doi:10.1023/A:1005504222101
- Martins, J. R. (2011). *Encantaria na umbanda [Encantaria in Umbanda]* (Unpublished master's thesis). Universidade de São Paulo, Ribeirão Preto.
- Menezes, A., Jr. (2012). *Estudo prospectivo sobre o diagnóstico diferencial entre experiências mediúnicas e transtornos mentais de conteúdo religioso [Prospective study on the differential diagnosis between psychic experiences and mental disorders of a religious nature]* (Unpublished PhD dissertation). Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora, Minas Gerais, Brazil.

- Menezes, A., Jr., Alminhana, L., & Moreira-Almeida, A. (2012). Sociodemographic and anomalous experiences profile in subjects with psychotic and dissociative experiences in religious groups. *Revista De Psiquiatria Clínica*, 39, 203–207.
- Moreira-Almeida, A., Almeida, A. A., & Lotufo Neto, F. (2005). History of “Spiritist madness” in Brazil. *History of Psychiatry*, 16(1), 5–25. doi:10.1177/0957154X05044602
- Moreira-Almeida, A., & Cardeña, E. (2011). Differential diagnosis between non-pathological psychotic and spiritual experiences and mental disorders: A contribution from Latin American studies to the ICD-11. *Revista Brasileira De Psiquiatria*, 33, 21–36. doi:10.1590/S1516-44462011000500004
- Moreira-Almeida, A., Koenig, H. G., & Lucchetti, G. (2014). Clinical implications of spirituality to mental health: Review of evidence and practical guidelines. *Revista Brasileira De Psiquiatria*, 36(2), 176–182. doi:10.1590/1516-4446-2013-1255
- Moreira-Almeida, A., & Koss-Chioino, J. D. (2009). Recognition and treatment of psychotic symptoms: Spiritists compared to mental health professionals in Puerto Rico and Brazil. *Psychiatry: Interpersonal and Biological Processes*, 72(3), 268–283. doi:10.1521/psyc.2009.72.3.268
- Moreira-Almeida, A., Lotufo Neto, F., & Cardeña, E. (2008). Comparison of Brazilian Spiritist mediumship and dissociative identity disorder. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, 196(5), 420–424. doi:10.1097/NMD.0b013e31816ff3a1
- Moreira-Almeida, A., Lotufo Neto, F., & Greyson, B. (2007). Dissociative and psychotic experiences in Brazilian Spiritist mediums. *Psychotherapy and Psychosomatics*, 76(1), 57–58. doi:10.1159/000096365
- Mota, C., & Trad., L. (2011). We live to take care of the population: Health care strategies and meanings for health, disease and healing in Candomblé temples. *Saúde E Sociedade*, 20, 325–337. doi:10.1590/S0104-12902011000200006
- Negro, J., Palladino-Negro, P., & Louzã, M. R. (2002). Do religious mediumship dissociative experiences conform to the sociocognitive theory of dissociation? *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 3, 51–73. doi:10.1300/J229v03n01\_05
- Nye, C. (2012, November 19). *Possession, Jinn and Britain’s backstreet exorcists*. Retrieved from the BBC News website: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-20357997>
- Prandi, R. (1991). *Os candomblés de São Paulo [Candomblé temples in São Paulo]*. São Paulo, Brazil: Hucitec.
- Prandi, R. (2004). O Brasil com Axé: Candomblé e Umbanda no mercado Religioso [Brazil with Axe: Candomblé and Umbanda in the religious market]. *Estudos Avançados*, 18(52), 223–238. doi:10.1590/S0103-40142004000300015
- Rabelo, M. (2008). A possessão como prática: Esboço de uma reflexão fenomenológica [Possession as a practice: Sketch of a phenomenological reflection]. *Mana magazine. Studies in Social Anthropology*, 14, 87–117.
- Roder, F., & Opalic, P. (1987). Effect of the hodja (magic healer) on Turkish psychiatric patients in West Germany: An evaluation of clinical examples. *Psychiatrische Praxis*, 14(5), 157–162.
- Ross, C. (2011). Possession experiences in dissociative identity disorder: A preliminary study. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 12(4), 393–400. doi:10.1080/15299732.2011.573762
- Ross, C., & Ness, L. (2010). Symptom patterns in dissociative identity disorder patients and the general population. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 11(4), 458–468. doi:10.1080/15299732.2010.495939
- Ross, C., Schroeder, E., & Ness, L. (2013). Dissociation and symptoms of culture-bound syndromes in North America: A preliminary study. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 14(2), 224–235. doi:10.1080/15299732.2013.724338
- Sar, V., Alioğlu, F., & Akyüz, G. (2014). Experiences of possession and paranormal phenomena among women in the general population: Are they related to traumatic

- stress and dissociation? *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 15(3), 303–318. doi:10.1080/15299732.2013.849321
- Schmidt, E. B. (2011, June). *The re-Africanisation of the Brazilian religion Candomblé and the holy war against the Orixá (God) in Brazil*. Paper presented at CESNUR's International Conference, Aletheia University, Danshui (Taipei), Taiwan.
- Somer, E. (2008). Dissociative disorders psychotherapy outcome research: In favor of single case studies. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 7(2), 1–5. doi:10.1300/J229v07n02\_01
- Souza, A. (Ed.). (2004). *Encantaria Brasileira: O livros dos mestres, caboclos e encantados* [Brazilian Encantaria: The book of the spirits and disembodied masters]. Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: Editora Pallas.
- Zangari, W. (2005). Uma leitura psicossocial do fenômeno de incorporação na Umbanda [A psychosocial reading of possession phenomenon in the Umbanda Religion]. *Boletim Da Academia Paulista De Psicologia*, 3(5), 70–88.